

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF PUERTO RICO**

## **SOUTHWIRE COMPANY, et al.,**

## **Plaintiffs,**

v.

Civil No. 03-1100 (GAG/MBB)

**RAMALLO BROTHERS PRINTING,  
INC., et al.,**

## **Defendants.**

## **MEMORANDUM AND ORDER**

Presently before the court is Ramallo Brothers Printing's motion (Docket No. 498) requesting the disqualification of the plaintiffs' counsel, on which the court has been thoroughly briefed by both sides (see Docket Nos. 505, 517, 533, 537, 544, 548, 549). For the reasons stated herein, the court **DENIES** Ramallo's motion (Docket No. 498).

A motion to disqualify an attorney is an accepted and adequate way for a litigant to bring a potential conflict of interest to the court's attention. See Reyes Canada v. Rey Hernandez, 193 F. Supp. 2d 409, 411 (D.P.R. 2002). Courts, however, should be cautious in analyzing a disqualification motion because they are often used for strategic purposes. See Somascan Plaza, Inc. v. Siemens Medical Systems, 187 F.R.D. 34, 37 (D.P.R. 1999) (citations omitted). Further, disqualifying a "party's chosen attorney is a serious matter which could not be supported by the mere possibility of a conflict." Estrada v. Cabrera, 632 F. Supp. 1174, 1175 (D.P.R. 1986) (citing Richmond Hilton Assoc. v. City of Richmond, 690 F.2d 1086, 1089 (4th Cir.1982)). Thus, courts must balance a client's right to be represented by an attorney of their choice and the integrity of the legal system. See Kevlik v. Goldstein, 724 F.2d 844, 850 (1st Cir. 1984); Polyagro Plastics, Inc. v. Cincinnati Milacron, Inc., 903 F. Supp. 253, 256 (D.P.R. 1995).

Defendants argue that plaintiff's legal representation, the law firm of O'Neill & Borges ("O&B"), should be held to be in violation of the attorney-client privilege and disqualified because in March 2008 they hired attorney Ms. Walewska Watkins ("Watkins"), who had previously worked

**Civil No. 03-1100 (GAG/CVR)**

2

1 with the law firm John F. Nevares & Associates (“Nevares & Associates”) while the same was  
2 providing legal services to the defendants in the instant litigation.

3 Rule 1.9(a) of the Model Rules of Professional Conduct provides:

4 A lawyer who has formerly represented a client in a matter shall not thereafter  
5 represent another person in the same or a substantially related matter in which that  
6 person's interests are materially adverse to the interests of the former client unless the  
7 former client gives informed consent, confirmed in writing.

8 In turn, Rule 1.10(a), cited by the defendants, states that “[w]hile lawyers are associated in a firm,  
9 none of them shall knowingly represent a client when any one of them practicing alone would be  
10 prohibited from doing so by Rules 1.7 or 1.9, unless the prohibition is based on a personal interest  
11 of the prohibited lawyer and does not present a significant risk of materially limiting the  
12 representation of the client by the remaining lawyers in the firm.” The defendants contend that  
13 because Watkins worked on matters related to this case while at Nevares & Associates in  
14 representation of Ramallo’s interests, under Rule 1.10(a) the firm was prohibited, upon hiring  
15 Watkins, from representing Southwire in the same litigation. This result, argue the defendants,  
16 might only be avoided if the former client who’s interests are affected gives informed consent in  
writing, under Rule 1.10(c), which has not, and will not, happen in this case.

17 Plaintiffs counter by arguing that the applicable rule regarding the imputation of conflicts of  
18 interest is Rule 1.10(a) as amended by the ABA’s House of Delegates in Resolution 109, on  
19 February 16, 2009, which expressly permits the use of screening procedures to avoid the imputation  
of conflicts of interest:

20 (a) While lawyers are associated in a firm, none of them shall knowingly represent  
21 a client when any one of them practicing alone would be prohibited from doing so  
22 by Rules 1.7 or 1.9, unless . . .

23 (2) the prohibition is based upon Rule 1.9(a) or (b) and arises out of the disqualified  
lawyer’s association with a prior firm, and

24 (i) the disqualified lawyer is timely screened from any participation  
25 in the matter and is apportioned no part of the fee therefrom;

26 (ii) written notice is promptly given to any affected former client to  
enable the former client to ascertain compliance with the provisions  
27 of this Rule, which shall include a description of the screening  
procedures employed; a statement of the firm’s and of the screened  
lawyer’s compliance with these Rules; a statement that review may  
28 be available before a tribunal; and an agreement by the firm to

1 respond promptly to any written inquiries or objections by the  
2 former client about the screening procedures; and

3 (iii) certifications of compliance with these Rules and with the  
4 screening procedures are provided to the former client by the  
5 screened lawyer and by a partner of the firm, at reasonable intervals  
6 upon the former client's written request and upon termination of the  
7 screening procedures.

8 O&B contends that, upon hiring Watkins, it implemented what is commonly referred to as a  
9 "Chinese Wall" in order to isolate Watkins from the Southwire case, because they knew that her  
10 previous law firm had handled the instant case during the time that she worked there. They aver  
11 that, even though Watkins acquired confidential information while at Nevares & Associates  
12 regarding this case, they implemented appropriate screening procedures to insulate the office from  
13 the appearance of impropriety. Therefore, disqualification is uncalled for. Counsel for Ramallo  
14 vigorously argues against the applicability of the amendment to Rule 1.10(a) in the instant case, and  
15 that screening procedures cannot be used to save a hiring firm from the imputation of a conflict of  
16 interest in a case such as this. Alternatively, they argue against the adequacy of O&B's screening  
17 procedures.

18 After reviewing all of the parties' arguments and the applicable case law, it is the court's  
19 understanding that it need not delve into those issues. The court is persuaded by Southwire's  
20 argument that, under Rule 1.10(b) of the Model Rules of Professional Conduct, the fact that Ms.  
21 Watkins is no longer working at O&B disposes of this matter entirely. Rule 1.10(b) provides that

22 When a lawyer has terminated an association with a firm, the firm is not prohibited  
23 from thereafter representing a person with interests materially adverse to those of  
24 a client represented by the formerly associated lawyer and not currently represented  
25 by the firm, unless:

26 (1) the matter is the same or substantially related to that in which the formerly  
27 associated lawyer represented the client; and  
28 (2) any lawyer remaining in the firm has information protected by Rules 1.6 and  
1.9(c) that is material to the matter.<sup>1</sup>

---

29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83  
84  
85  
86  
87  
88  
89  
90  
91  
92  
93  
94  
95  
96  
97  
98  
99  
100  
101  
102  
103  
104  
105  
106  
107  
108  
109  
110  
111  
112  
113  
114  
115  
116  
117  
118  
119  
120  
121  
122  
123  
124  
125  
126  
127  
128  
129  
130  
131  
132  
133  
134  
135  
136  
137  
138  
139  
140  
141  
142  
143  
144  
145  
146  
147  
148  
149  
150  
151  
152  
153  
154  
155  
156  
157  
158  
159  
160  
161  
162  
163  
164  
165  
166  
167  
168  
169  
170  
171  
172  
173  
174  
175  
176  
177  
178  
179  
180  
181  
182  
183  
184  
185  
186  
187  
188  
189  
190  
191  
192  
193  
194  
195  
196  
197  
198  
199  
200  
201  
202  
203  
204  
205  
206  
207  
208  
209  
210  
211  
212  
213  
214  
215  
216  
217  
218  
219  
220  
221  
222  
223  
224  
225  
226  
227  
228  
229  
230  
231  
232  
233  
234  
235  
236  
237  
238  
239  
240  
241  
242  
243  
244  
245  
246  
247  
248  
249  
250  
251  
252  
253  
254  
255  
256  
257  
258  
259  
260  
261  
262  
263  
264  
265  
266  
267  
268  
269  
270  
271  
272  
273  
274  
275  
276  
277  
278  
279  
280  
281  
282  
283  
284  
285  
286  
287  
288  
289  
290  
291  
292  
293  
294  
295  
296  
297  
298  
299  
300  
301  
302  
303  
304  
305  
306  
307  
308  
309  
310  
311  
312  
313  
314  
315  
316  
317  
318  
319  
320  
321  
322  
323  
324  
325  
326  
327  
328  
329  
330  
331  
332  
333  
334  
335  
336  
337  
338  
339  
340  
341  
342  
343  
344  
345  
346  
347  
348  
349  
350  
351  
352  
353  
354  
355  
356  
357  
358  
359  
360  
361  
362  
363  
364  
365  
366  
367  
368  
369  
370  
371  
372  
373  
374  
375  
376  
377  
378  
379  
380  
381  
382  
383  
384  
385  
386  
387  
388  
389  
390  
391  
392  
393  
394  
395  
396  
397  
398  
399  
400  
401  
402  
403  
404  
405  
406  
407  
408  
409  
410  
411  
412  
413  
414  
415  
416  
417  
418  
419  
420  
421  
422  
423  
424  
425  
426  
427  
428  
429  
430  
431  
432  
433  
434  
435  
436  
437  
438  
439  
440  
441  
442  
443  
444  
445  
446  
447  
448  
449  
450  
451  
452  
453  
454  
455  
456  
457  
458  
459  
460  
461  
462  
463  
464  
465  
466  
467  
468  
469  
470  
471  
472  
473  
474  
475  
476  
477  
478  
479  
480  
481  
482  
483  
484  
485  
486  
487  
488  
489  
490  
491  
492  
493  
494  
495  
496  
497  
498  
499  
500  
501  
502  
503  
504  
505  
506  
507  
508  
509  
510  
511  
512  
513  
514  
515  
516  
517  
518  
519  
520  
521  
522  
523  
524  
525  
526  
527  
528  
529  
530  
531  
532  
533  
534  
535  
536  
537  
538  
539  
540  
541  
542  
543  
544  
545  
546  
547  
548  
549  
550  
551  
552  
553  
554  
555  
556  
557  
558  
559  
5510  
5511  
5512  
5513  
5514  
5515  
5516  
5517  
5518  
5519  
5520  
5521  
5522  
5523  
5524  
5525  
5526  
5527  
5528  
5529  
5530  
5531  
5532  
5533  
5534  
5535  
5536  
5537  
5538  
5539  
55310  
55311  
55312  
55313  
55314  
55315  
55316  
55317  
55318  
55319  
55320  
55321  
55322  
55323  
55324  
55325  
55326  
55327  
55328  
55329  
55330  
55331  
55332  
55333  
55334  
55335  
55336  
55337  
55338  
55339  
55340  
55341  
55342  
55343  
55344  
55345  
55346  
55347  
55348  
55349  
55350  
55351  
55352  
55353  
55354  
55355  
55356  
55357  
55358  
55359  
55360  
55361  
55362  
55363  
55364  
55365  
55366  
55367  
55368  
55369  
55370  
55371  
55372  
55373  
55374  
55375  
55376  
55377  
55378  
55379  
55380  
55381  
55382  
55383  
55384  
55385  
55386  
55387  
55388  
55389  
55390  
55391  
55392  
55393  
55394  
55395  
55396  
55397  
55398  
55399  
553100  
553101  
553102  
553103  
553104  
553105  
553106  
553107  
553108  
553109  
553110  
553111  
553112  
553113  
553114  
553115  
553116  
553117  
553118  
553119  
553120  
553121  
553122  
553123  
553124  
553125  
553126  
553127  
553128  
553129  
553130  
553131  
553132  
553133  
553134  
553135  
553136  
553137  
553138  
553139  
553140  
553141  
553142  
553143  
553144  
553145  
553146  
553147  
553148  
553149  
553150  
553151  
553152  
553153  
553154  
553155  
553156  
553157  
553158  
553159  
553160  
553161  
553162  
553163  
553164  
553165  
553166  
553167  
553168  
553169  
553170  
553171  
553172  
553173  
553174  
553175  
553176  
553177  
553178  
553179  
553180  
553181  
553182  
553183  
553184  
553185  
553186  
553187  
553188  
553189  
553190  
553191  
553192  
553193  
553194  
553195  
553196  
553197  
553198  
553199  
553200  
553201  
553202  
553203  
553204  
553205  
553206  
553207  
553208  
553209  
553210  
553211  
553212  
553213  
553214  
553215  
553216  
553217  
553218  
553219  
553220  
553221  
553222  
553223  
553224  
553225  
553226  
553227  
553228  
553229  
553230  
553231  
553232  
553233  
553234  
553235  
553236  
553237  
553238  
553239  
553240  
553241  
553242  
553243  
553244  
553245  
553246  
553247  
553248  
553249  
553250  
553251  
553252  
553253  
553254  
553255  
553256  
553257  
553258  
553259  
553260  
553261  
553262  
553263  
553264  
553265  
553266  
553267  
553268  
553269  
553270  
553271  
553272  
553273  
553274  
553275  
553276  
553277  
553278  
553279  
553280  
553281  
553282  
553283  
553284  
553285  
553286  
553287  
553288  
553289  
553290  
553291  
553292  
553293  
553294  
553295  
553296  
553297  
553298  
553299  
553300  
553301  
553302  
553303  
553304  
553305  
553306  
553307  
553308  
553309  
553310  
553311  
553312  
553313  
553314  
553315  
553316  
553317  
553318  
553319  
553320  
553321  
553322  
553323  
553324  
553325  
553326  
553327  
553328  
553329  
553330  
553331  
553332  
553333  
553334  
553335  
553336  
553337  
553338  
553339  
553340  
553341  
553342  
553343  
553344  
553345  
553346  
553347  
553348  
553349  
553350  
553351  
553352  
553353  
553354  
553355  
553356  
553357  
553358  
553359  
553360  
553361  
553362  
553363  
553364  
553365  
553366  
553367  
553368  
553369  
553370  
553371  
553372  
553373  
553374  
553375  
553376  
553377  
553378  
553379  
553380  
553381  
553382  
553383  
553384  
553385  
553386  
553387  
553388  
553389  
553390  
553391  
553392  
553393  
553394  
553395  
553396  
553397  
553398  
553399  
553400  
553401  
553402  
553403  
553404  
553405  
553406  
553407  
553408  
553409  
553410  
553411  
553412  
553413  
553414  
553415  
553416  
553417  
553418  
553419  
553420  
553421  
553422  
553423  
553424  
553425  
553426  
553427  
553428  
553429  
553430  
553431  
553432  
553433  
553434  
553435  
553436  
553437  
553438  
553439  
553440  
553441  
553442  
553443  
553444  
553445  
553446  
553447  
553448  
553449  
553450  
553451  
553452  
553453  
553454  
553455  
553456  
553457  
553458  
553459  
553460  
553461  
553462  
553463  
553464  
553465  
553466  
553467  
553468  
553469  
553470  
553471  
553472  
553473  
553474  
553475  
553476  
553477  
553478  
553479  
553480  
553481  
553482  
553483  
553484  
553485  
553486  
553487  
553488  
553489  
553490  
553491  
553492  
553493  
553494  
553495  
553496  
553497  
553498  
553499  
553500  
553501  
553502  
553503  
553504  
553505  
553506  
553507  
553508  
553509  
553510  
553511  
553512  
553513  
553514  
553515  
553516  
553517  
553518  
553519  
553520  
553521  
553522  
553523  
553524  
553525  
553526  
553527  
553528  
553529  
553530  
553531  
553532  
553533  
553534  
553535  
553536  
553537  
553538  
553539  
553540  
553541  
553542  
553543  
553544  
553545  
553546  
553547  
553548  
553549  
553550  
553551  
553552  
553553  
553554  
553555  
553556  
553557  
553558  
553559  
553560  
553561  
553562  
553563  
553564  
553565  
553566  
553567  
553568  
553569  
553570  
553571  
553572  
553573  
553574  
553575  
553576  
553577  
553578  
553579  
553580  
553581  
553582  
553583  
553584  
553585  
553586  
553587  
553588  
553589  
553590  
553591  
553592  
553593  
553594  
553595  
553596  
553597  
553598  
553599  
553600  
553601  
553602  
553603  
553604  
553605  
553606  
553607  
553608  
553609  
553610  
553611  
553612  
553613  
553614  
553615  
553616  
553617  
553618  
553619  
553620  
553621  
553622  
553623  
553624  
553625  
553626  
553627  
553628  
553629  
553630  
553631  
553632  
553633  
553634  
553635  
553636  
553637  
553638  
553639  
553640  
553641  
553642  
553643  
553644  
553645  
553646  
553647  
553648  
553649  
553650  
553651  
553652  
553653  
553654  
553655  
553656  
553657  
553658  
553659  
553660  
553661  
553662  
553663  
553664  
553665  
553666  
553667  
553668  
553669  
553670  
553671  
553672  
553673  
553674  
553675  
553676  
553677  
553678  
553679  
553680  
553681  
553682  
553683  
553684  
553685  
553686  
553687  
553688  
553689  
553690  
553691  
553692  
553693  
553694  
553695  
553696  
553697  
553698  
553699  
553700  
553701  
553702  
553703  
553704  
553705  
553706  
553707  
553708  
553709  
553710  
553711  
553712  
553713  
553714  
553715  
553716  
553717  
553718  
553719  
553720  
553721  
553722  
553723  
553724  
553725  
553726  
553727  
553728  
553729  
553730  
553731  
553732  
553733  
553734  
553735  
553736  
553737  
553738  
553739  
5537340  
5537341  
5537342  
5537343  
5537344  
5537345  
5537346  
5537347  
5537348  
5537349  
5537350  
5537351  
5537352  
5537353  
5537354  
5537355  
5537356  
5537357  
5537358  
5537359  
55373510  
55373511  
55373512  
55373513  
55373514  
55373515  
55373516  
55373517  
55373518  
55373519  
55373520  
55373521  
55373522  
55373523  
55373524  
55373525  
55373526  
55373527  
55373528  
55373529  
55373530  
55373531  
55373532  
55373533  
55373534  
55373535  
55373536  
55373537  
55373538  
55373539  
55373540  
55373541  
55373542  
55373543  
55373544  
55373545  
55373546  
55373547  
55373548  
55373549  
55373550  
55373551  
55373552  
55373553  
55373554  
55373555  
55373556  
55373557  
55373558  
55373559  
55373560  
55373561  
55373562  
55373563  
55373564  
55373565  
55373566  
55373567  
55373568  
55373569  
55373570  
55373571  
55373572  
55373573  
55373574  
55373575  
55373576  
55373577  
55373578  
55373579  
55373580  
55373581  
55373582  
55373583  
55373584  
55373585  
55373586  
55373587  
55373588  
55373589  
55373590  
55373591  
55373592  
55373593  
55373594  
55373595  
55373596  
55373597  
55373598  
55373599  
553735100  
553735101  
553735102  
553735103  
553735104  
553735105  
553735106  
553735107  
553735108  
553735109  
553735110  
553735111  
553735112  
553735113  
553735114  
553735115  
553735116  
553735117  
553735118  
553735119  
553735120  
553735121  
553735122  
553735123  
553735124  
553735125  
553735126  
553735127  
553735128  
553735129  
553735130  
553735131  
553735132  
553735133  
553735134  
553735135  
553735136  
553735137  
553735138  
553735139  
553735140  
553735141  
553735142  
553735143  
553735144  
553735145  
553735146  
553735147  
553735148  
553735149  
553735150  
553735151  
553735152  
553735153  
553735154  
553735155  
553735156  
553735157  
553735158  
553735159  
553735160  
553735161  
553735162  
553735163  
553735164  
553735165  
553735166  
553735167  
553735168  
553735169  
553735170  
553735171  
553735172  
553735173  
553735174  
553735175  
553735176  
553735177  
553735178  
553735179  
553735180  
553735

## **Civil No. 03-1100 (GAG/CVR)**

4

1 Because Watkins left the firm in March 2009, unless the movants here proved that Wakins *in fact*  
2 shared protected information gleaned from her previous employment at Nevares & Associates with  
3 her co-workers at O&B while she still worked there, Rule 1.10(b) lifts any prohibition that  
4 previously could apply through the imputation of a conflict of interest. At the evidentiary hearing,  
5 the court gave credence to the testimony of all O&B witnesses, that no one at O&B had spoken to  
6 Ms. Watkins about the case at hand, except in regards to the screening procedures. In fact, the court  
7 stated that it had no reason to believe that Watkins had affirmatively transmitted any information  
8 to anyone at O&B, so that those facts were not in dispute. (See Tr. of Motion Hearing at 27-28.)  
9 Moreover, the court noted that Ramallo had failed to provide any objective evidence to refute the  
10 allegation that no confidences were in fact exchanged with O&B attorneys or personnel. (See Tr.  
11 of Motion Hearing at 17-18.) Given this factual background, the court must conclude that, under  
12 Rule 1.10(b), O&B is now free to represent Southwire.

13 For the aforementioned reasons, the motion for disqualification (Docket No. 498) is  
14 **DENIED.**

15 || SO ORDERED.

In San Juan, Puerto Rico this 19th day of October, 2009.

S/Gustavo A. Gelpí

GUSTAVO A. GELPI  
United States District Judge